



www.coloradoclimate.org

DRAFT TELECONFERENCE MEETING SUMMARY
AFW Policy Working Group
Call #5, May 4, 2007

Members Attending:

Tom Fry
Tony Frank (Farmer's Union)
Meg Collins
Suzie Gordon
Tim Sullivan
Robyn Nick (sub Mel Coleman)
Keith Paustian
Mike Bowman
Matt Baker

Governmental agency liaisons: none

Rocky Mountain Climate Organization: Tom Easley

Center for Climate Strategies: Katie Bickel, Steve Roe

Agenda Item#1: Review of Call #4 Summary. CCS reviewed the call summary and requested input from the PWG. One PWG member noted that in the final list of 10 priority options the option to Prevent Landfilling of Unprocessed Organic Material should include recycling. It was noted that this was included in the minutes, but did not make it into the table itself. CCS agreed and noted this was also raised in the CAP. No clarification or changes needed.

Agenda Item#2: Review of outcomes from the CAP. CCS reported about the CAP meeting. The CAP provided the following recommendations to the PWG: AFW-9 needs to be expanded to address source reduction and recycling in general, looking at more than the organic fraction of the waste. The PWG should consider including and urban tree element in AFW-8. There are several cities in CO with tree planting programs and that it was important to consider this as an element. All other options were reviewed by the CAP and approved for moving forward. In preparation for the next CAP meeting, the PWG needs to develop the first two sections of the policy template by next Friday, May 11.

Agenda Item#3: Discussion/development of Policy Option Straw Proposals. CCS reviewed options that included language developed by PWG members first and options with draft CCS placeholder language second. CCS emphasized that what we're trying to do now is complete the first two sections of the policy template for CAP approval.

AFW-1 Agricultural Crop Management: This option focuses on combination of no-till and nutrient management, organic farming and biochar (future technology). Some preliminary numbers have been added on baseline adoption of no-till practices. Baseline land use data for dryland, CRP, and irrigated cropland were also added. There is roughly 2.5 million ha of cropland in CO, 15% of which is already under no-till cultivation. Draft goal levels in the latest version of the options were not adjusted.

The role of water consumption and fertilizer use was discussed. Water consumption trends are such that reductions in the amount of irrigation by 2020 are very likely. Water consumption produces mostly indirect reductions by shifting the types of management practices in use. The potential direct reductions (e.g., reduced use of pumps) are covered under other options. Therefore, it was agreed to address water consumption in other aspects of this option.

Nutrient management. It was noted that in CO, livestock producers are required to submit a nutrient management plan to receive incentives. Thus, there is already a lot of interest/action on improving nutrient use efficiency in the State. Another PWG member noted a national estimate of the potential to reduce N₂O emissions by 30%, in part from reduced fertilizer use. There is some indication that efficiencies can be tightened up a bit. The PWG agreed to a goal of 10% reduction by 2012 and 20% reduction in fertilizer use by 2020.

The Rocky Mountain Park plan to reduce nitrogen deposition in the park may be relevant; the PWG agreed they needed to look at the plan and note overlaps with this option.

AFW-3: The PWG decided to change the title to “Reductions in On-Farm Fossil Energy Use” to clarify that total energy use does not need to change for GHG emissions to be reduced, e.g., through substitution with renewable fuels and hybrid technologies (e.g., B-20 fuel, hybrid combine tractors). In addition, generating electricity for use on-farm fits under this option as well. The PWG decided to develop separate goals for liquid fossil fuels and electricity reduction: 10% reduction in electricity use by 2012 and 40% reduction by 2020; and 5% reduction in use of petrodiesel on farm by 2012 and 20% reduction by 2020

The overlaps with this and other AFW options were noted. Specifically, implementing no-till (AFW-1) reduces the number of passes with a tractor captured; the manure management option (AFW-2) addresses reductions in energy use from the implementation of anaerobic digesters.

AFW-4: Biodiesel. There was a discussion about the capacity of CO to produce enough feedstocks to meet demand in CO. CCS reviewed the approach to quantifying this option: the TLU group quantifies the impacts of increased demand; AFW quantifies the impacts of increasing production of “GHG superior biodiesel.” There was a discussion of the benefits and trade-offs of local production of biodiesel. The PWG agreed that they want to incentivize low carbon production of biofuels. Concerns were raised about incentives that could promote the conversion of native grasslands to production for biofuels.

Goal was revised slightly: “Produce enough in-state biodiesel to offset 2% of Colorado’s petrodiesel consumption by 2012 and 20% by 2020 using GHG superior feedstocks” (revised goal changes timing to 2% by 2012 and adds phrase about GHG superior feedstocks).

There was discussion of algal technology as a potential future production method of GHG superior feedstocks.

AFW-5 Ethanol Production. The low carbon fuel standard in TLU is intended to drive the demand for feedstocks produced under this option (and AFW-4). By the end of this year CO will produce more starch-based ethanol in-state than will be used. The PWG discussed and agreed that this options could target increasing the percent of in-state production of ethanol using GHG superior technology. The commercially viable of cellulosic ethanol was discussed and is anticipated by 2015. Current levels of starch based ethanol production are 200-250 million gallons per year.

The PWG arrived at a goal of producing 50 million gallons per year above BAU of GHG superior ethanol by 2012 and 400 million gallons above BAU per year by 2020. (where BAU refers to starch based ethanol.)

AFW-2: Manure Management and Energy Programs. The draft language is fine for the description. Discussion of net metering and the costs of implementation, co-benefits were also discussed. There was agreement about the value of implementing anaerobic digesters. Most large operations in CO are cattle operations, where cost effectiveness is lower than dairy and swine operations in general. PWG agreed to start with the goal below and iterate as needed. Background statistics provided: ~250 CAFO’s in the state and the number is declining over the next 5 years, probably to 225 CAFO’s; there are about 1.1 million animals on feed in CO currently.

Revised Goal: Implement manure management and energy programs on 10 CAFO’s by 2012 and 80% of all CAFO’s by 2020

AFW-6: A PWG member will provide projections out to 2030 for land conversion in the state based on census data. There was a suggestion to reformat goals to specify the amount of land to protect, rather than reducing the rate of conversion. Biggest carbon benefits are in protecting forest lands or rangelands. CO has robust funding sources for land protection.

Revised Goal: Protect 2 million acres of land in natural cover that would have been converted to development by 2020

AFW-7. Policy designed to incentivize the infrastructure for collection and use of biomass. A biomass gasification plant exists in CO, very small scale with plans to ramp up. There are a few initiatives underway to quantify the potential supply, some will have data available over the next few months. CCS has a report from NREL and will circulate to the volunteer groups for

assessment. One potential implementation mechanism would be to encourage rural school districts to use biomass for heating.

Revised Goal: Increase production and use by a factor of 3 in 2012 and by a factor of 10 by 2020 through sustainable harvesting and recovery practices.

AFW-9.. Brief discussion about the goal levels. It was decided to revise the goal to: divert 25% of waste using ...[I MISSED THIS] by 2012 and 50% by 2020. PWG member will provide information on baseline levels. (Baseline rates are 8-9% of organic material diverted). The definition of diverted was reviewed.

AFW-8. The PWG noted the need to clarify what is meant by forest productivity and to have it refer to forest ecosystem carbon sequestration rather than near-term production of wood for products.. The PWG noted there is negligible production of large diameter wood for durable products in CO and this part of the draft option description should be dropped. There are opportunities to reduce emissions from intense stand replacing fires in lower montain ponderosa pine stands. Thinning, treatments can be implemented that reduce the risk of stand replacing fire. The impacts of programs that reduce fire risk on long-term carbon storage and trace gas emissions were discussed and a revised goal developed.

Revised goal: treating [10%] of lower elevation ponderosa pine to reduce risk of stand replacement fires and increase productivity by 2020

AFW-10 [Steve, can you add something here]

Agenda Item#4: Next Steps for PWG. RMCO

CCS will circulate the revised draft on Monday (5/7) and request responses by Friday (5/11).
Potential PWG dates

Agenda Item#5: Review and Discussion of the Colorado GHG Inventory and Forecast.

Not enough time, postponed until the next call.

Agenda Item#6: Agenda, Time and Date for Next Call.

Next CAP meeting: May 22, 2007

Tentative PWG meeting dates: May 24, June 15, July 13, and August 3 (all from 1:00 – 4:30 PM)

Agenda Item#7: Public Input and Announcements. No members of the public present.

Preliminary Number	Revised Number	Preliminary Title	PWG Volunteers (lead volunteer in bold)
AFW-1	AFW-1	Agricultural Crop Management	Tony Frank ¹ , Mike Bowman, Keith Paustian
AFW-2	AFW-8	Forestry Programs to Enhance GHG Benefits	Mike Ryan , Tom Fry, Tim Sullivan
AFW-3	AFW-2	Manure Management and Energy Utilization	Mike Bowman, Meg Collins , Susie Gordon
AFW-4	AFW-6	Preserve Lands with Carbon Storage Value	Tim Sullivan , Tom Compton, Will Shafroth, Tom Fry
AFW-5	AFW-9	Prevent Landfilling of Unprocessed Organic Material	Susie Gordon , Eric Lombardi
AFW-6	AFW-10	Landfill Methane Energy Programs	Eric Lombardi , Susie Gordon
AFW-7	AFW-4	Biodiesel Production	Tony Frank ¹ , Keith Paustian, John Ashworth
AFW-8	AFW-3	Reductions in On-Farm Energy Use	Tony Frank ¹ , Tom Compton
AFW-9	AFW-7	Biomass Feedstocks for Energy Production	Mike Bowman , Mike Ryan, Tom Fry, Lynda Joyce
AFW-10	AFW-5	Ethanol Production	Keith Paustian , Tom Compton, Mike Bowman, Tony Frank, ¹ John Ashworth

¹ With the Farmer's Union.

PWG Contact List:

Matt Baker	Environment Colorado	(303) 573-3871	
Mike Bowman	25x'25 Univ. of Colorado Board of Regents	ext. 309	mbaker@environmentcolorado.org
Tilman Bishop		(303) 570-9277	mike@echogreen.org
Mel Jr.	Coleman Natural Foods Colorado Livestock Association	(970) 244-1885	tilmanmb@bresnan.net
Meg Collins	La Plata Electric Association	(303) 468-2530	mcoleman@colemannatural.com
Tom Compton	Colorado Working Landscapes	(303) 413-1802	megcollins2@aol.com
John Covert	Rocky Mountain Farmers Union	(303) 283-3524	compton@frontier.net
Tony Frank	Colorado State University	(303) 752-5800	covert@workinglandscapes.com
Tony Frank		(303) 650-5818	tony.frank@co-ops.org
Tom Fry	The Wilderness Society	x 110	tony.frank@colostate.edu
			tom_fry@twso.org

Susie	Gordon	City of Fort Collins	(970) 221-6265	sgordon@fcgov.com
Steve	Hill	Summit County USDA Rocky Mtn	(970) 668-4202	SteveH@co.summit.co.us
Linda	Joyce	Research Station	(970) 498-2560	ljoyce@fs.fed.us
Eric	Lombardi	Eco-Cycle Natural Resources	(303) 444-6634	eric@ecocycle.org
Keith	Paustian	Ecology Lab, CSU USDA Rocky Mtn.	(970) 491-1547	keithp@nrel.colostate.edu
Mike	Ryan	Research Station Valley Wide Health	(970) 498-1012	mgryan@fs.fed.us
Marguerite	Salazar	Services Colorado Conservation		ceo@vwhs.org
Will	Shafroth	Trust The Nature Conservancy,	(720) 565-8289	wshafroth@coct.org
Tim	Sullivan	Colorado	(970) 974-7040	tim_sullivan@tnc.org
Stan	Zemler	Town of Vail	(970) 479-2105	szemler@vailgov.com
John	Ashworth	NREL	(303) 384-6858	john_ashworth@nrel.gov